

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------|---|----|
| I. | Preliminary Statement..... | 1 |
| II. | The Action Meets All the Requirements for Certification Under Rule 23..... | 2 |
| | A. Plaintiffs Satisfy the <i>Wal-Mart</i> Commonality Test..... | 2 |
| | B. All the Proposed Class Representatives Are Adequate and Typical..... | 4 |
| | i. Sean Turnbow is Adequate and Typical..... | 4 |
| | ii. Mary Rice and William Rice Are Adequate and Typical..... | 6 |
| | iii. Robert Yoskowitz is Adequate and Typical..... | 8 |
| | iv. Frederick Vieira is Adequate and Typical..... | 10 |
| | C. The Predominance Requirement is Met..... | 12 |
| | i. Common Issues Predominate..... | 12 |
| | ii. All Class and Subclass Members Are Similarly Harmed..... | 13 |
| | iii. A Class Action Is Superior to Individual Actions..... | 15 |
| III. | Conclusion..... | 15 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

| | |
|---|----------|
| <i>Bell Atl. Corp. v. AT&T Corp.</i> , 339 F.3d 294 (5 th Cir. 2003)..... | 14 |
| <i>Berger v. Compaq Computer Corp.</i> , 257 F.3d 475 (5th Cir. 2001)..... | 4, 9, 10 |
| <i>Bruhl v. Price Waterhousecoopers Int’l</i> , 257 F.R.D. 684 (S.D. Fla. 2008)..... | 8 |
| <i>Buettgen v. Harless</i> , 3:09-CV-791-K, 2011 WL 1938130 (N.D. Tex. May 19, 2011)..... | 4, 5 |
| <i>Chieftain Royalty Co. v. QEP Energy Energy Co.</i> , CIV-11-212-R, 2012 WL 896412 (W.D. Okla. Mar. 16, 2012)..... | 2 |
| <i>Cincinnati Ins. Co. v. Guccione</i> , 308 Ill. Supp. App. 3d 220 (Ill. Supp. App. Ct. 2d Dist. 1999)..... | 8 |
| <i>Coleman v. Exxon Chem. Corp.</i> , 162 F. Supp. 2d 593 (S.D. Tex. 2001)..... | 14 |
| <i>Feder v. Elec. Data Sys. Corp.</i> , 429 F.3d 125 (5th Cir. 2005)..... | 11 |
| <i>In re Enron Corp. Securities</i> , No. MDL 1446, 2006 WL 1662596 (S.D. Tex. June 7, 2006)..... | 15 |
| <i>In re Int’l Profit Assocs., Inc.</i> , 286 S.W.3d 921 (Tex. 2009)..... | 8 |
| <i>In re Prudential Ins. Co. of Am.</i> , 148 S.W.3d 124 (Tex. 2004)..... | 8 |
| <i>Johns v. Bayer Corp.</i> , 09CV1935 AJB POR, 2012 WL 368032 (S.D. Cal. Feb. 3, 2012)..... | 3 |
| <i>Johnson v. General Mills, Inc.</i> , 275 F.R.D. 282 (C.D. Cal. 2011)..... | 15 |
| <i>Kase v. Salomon Smith Barney, Inc.</i> , 218 F.R.D. 149 (S.D. Tex. 2003)..... | 15 |
| <i>Lehocky v. Tidel Technologies, Inc.</i> , 220 F.R.D. 491 (S.D. Tex. 2004)..... | 4, 9 |
| <i>Lundy v. Masson</i> , 260 S.W.3d 482 (Tex. Supp. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 2008, pet. denied)..... | 8 |
| <i>Lymburner v. U.S. Financial Funds, Inc.</i> , 263 F.R.D. 534 (N.D. Cal. 2010)..... | 15 |
| <i>M.D. ex rel. Stukenberg v. Perry</i> , 675 F.3d 832 (5th Cir. 2012)..... | 2, 3, 4 |
| <i>Myan Mgmt. Group, L.L.C. v. Adam Sparks Family Revocable Trust</i> , 292 S.W.3d 750 (Tex. App—Dallas 2009, no pet.)..... | 8 |

| | |
|--|---------|
| <i>Norwest Mtg., Inc. v. Superior Court</i> , 72 Cal. Rptr. 2d 18 (1999)..... | 9 |
| <i>Peterson v. H & R Block Tax Servs., Inc.</i> , 174 F.R.D. 78 (N.D. Ill. 1997)..... | 8 |
| <i>Ready Transport, Inc. v. AAR Manufacturing, Inc.</i> , 2006 WL 2131308 (E.D. Cal. July 27, 2006)..... | 9 |
| <i>Robidoux v. Celani</i> , 987 F.2d 931 (2d Cir. 1993)..... | 8 |
| <i>Sacred Heart Health Sys., Inc. v. Humana Military Healthcare Services, Inc.</i> , 601 F.3d 1159 (11th Cir. 2010)..... | 15 |
| <i>Seekamp v. It's Huge, Inc.</i> , No. 1:09-CV-00018, 2012 WL 860364 (N.D.N.Y. Mar. 13, 2012)..... | 12 |
| <i>Seijas v. Republic of Arg.</i> , 606 F.3d 53 (2d Cir. 2010)..... | 14 |
| <i>Spagnola v. Chubb Corp.</i> , 264 F.R.D. 76 (S.D.N.Y. 2010)..... | 12 |
| <i>State of Ala. v. Blue Bird Body Co., Inc.</i> , 573 F.2d 309 (5th Cir. 1978)..... | 13 |
| <i>Stott v. Capital Fin. Services, Inc.</i> , 277 F.R.D. 316 (N.D. Tex. 2011)..... | 4, 8 |
| <i>Tsirekidze v. Syntax-Brilliant Corp.</i> , CV-07-02204-PHX-FJM, 2009 WL 2151838 (D. Ariz. July 17, 2009)..... | 4, 7 |
| <i>Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes</i> , 131 S.Ct. 2541, 2551 (2011)..... | 1, 2, 3 |
| <i>Welling v. Alexy</i> , 155 F.R.D. 654 (N.D. Cal. 1994)..... | 4 |

RULES

| | |
|-------------------------|-------|
| Fed. R. Civ. P. 23..... | 2, 11 |
|-------------------------|-------|